SAIRLA Story of Change

Transferring lessons – learning from Burkina Faso for conflict mediation in Tanzania

Conflict between crop farmers and livestock herders is a serious concern in Tanzania, particularly in areas where transhumant livestock moves through areas where cropland is expanding. When presenting the findings of the ResLeSS project's learning process to the Ministry of Livestock and Fisheries in Dodoma, they were excited to hear about the experience in Burkina Faso, where the learning process created an opportunity to mediate the conflict between pastoralists and agro-pastoralists. In response, the ResLeSS team produced a policy brief showcasing the lessons from both Tanzania and Burkina Faso and held a series of meetings with members of the Ministry of Livestock and Fisheries, to provide more information about the learning process and CLEANED R tool and explore how it could be used for conflict resolution in Tanzania. So far, it has been agreed to include the learning process in the collection of tools used by the Conflict Resolution Committee and look for opportunities to test the process in a conflict-stricken area, such as Katavi region.

Introduction

Research and learning for sustainable intensification of smallholder livestock value chains (ResLeSS) is a project implemented by the Stockholm Environment Institute (SEI) and partners[1] under the Sustainable Agricultural Intensification Research and Learning in Africa (SAIRLA) programme. It aims to contribute to more equitable and environmentally sustainable livestock production in Burkina Faso, Ethiopia and Tanzania by providing decision-makers and investors in the sector with the evidence and tools needed to manage trade-offs between increased production and environmental impact. The project started in 2016 and focused on testing a computer-based tool (that was initially developed by the International Livestock Research Institute (ILRI)) to explore three fundamental characteristics of smallholder livestock production:

- The environmental impacts of livestock production;
- The benefits of smallholder livestock rearing; and the
- Smallholder decisions concerning the trade-off between livestock production and environmental impact.

The environmental impact assessment tool, the Comprehensive Livestock Environmental Assessment for Improved Nutrition, a Secured Environment and Sustainable Development (CLEANED R) tool, is embedded in a facilitated multi-stakeholder learning process to analyse environment and livelihood change in a particular community, together with that community. In this way, the aim is to provide a fast and informed evaluation of changes in the livestock production system in data-poor environments undergoing rapid change.

Sokoine University of Agriculture (SUA) and SEI selected Lushoto District as an ideal location to pilot the tool in Tanzania, building on previous work with the long-running Maziwa Zaidi programme run by ILRI. The pilot phase is now coming to an end, having shown that the learning process and CLEANED-R tool are useful in enabling diverse stakeholders to articulate their views and perspectives on what livestock should provide in the future, including those who are not always represented such as women, youth and landless youth.

The CLEANED R tool, and the learning process it is embedded in, were also tested in Ethiopia and Burkina Faso. Results from Burkina Faso suggest that the tool can be useful in mitigating conflicts between farmers and livestock keepers. The relevance of this finding to Tanzania has emerged over the final months of the project as SAIRLA has facilitated government decision makers' engagement with project findings.

This story of change describes how the ResLeSS project's sharing of lessons between Burkina Faso and Tanzania has resulted in take up by the Government of Tanzania of the ResLeSS process and CLEANED-R tool into their portfolio of methods and approaches for engaging in areas with conflict.

1. The challenge

Demand for animal-sourced food has been increasing in Sub-Saharan Africa and is predicted to double in the upcoming twenty years (Enahoro et al., 2018). The main drivers are population growth leading to a higher demand for food in general as well as an increase in incomes leading to a shift from staple food diets towards more animal sourced food diets (Enahoro et al., 2018). This increasing demand for animal sourced food, also referred to as the 'livestock revolution' (Delgado et al., 2001), is simultaneously the biggest opportunity and one of the biggest threats to Sub-Saharan African countries.

Livestock across sub-Saharan Africa is central to the livelihood of poor communities both in rural and in urban settings. In high potential rural areas, livestock generally is part of an integrated mixed crop-livestock production system while in low potential areas, usually lowland areas, livestock is at the core of the agro-pastoral and pastoral systems. Livestock brings multiple benefits to the poor. The first benefit is the provision of high quality food. There is growing evidence that livestock keeping households consume more animal sourced food, have healthier diets and an increased well-being (Azzarri et al., 2015). Additionally, livestock generates income and often brings the cash needed for health care, school fees, and agricultural inputs. It provides manure as well as labour for ploughing and threshing (Moll, 2005). Manure is an important fertiliser for the already depleted soils in the mixed crop-livestock system, where farmers may not buy (much) chemical fertilisers. Finally, livestock serves as a financial instrument for savings and emergency cash as well as contributing to social status (Randolph et al., 2007). The livestock revolution foresees accelerated demands for livestock products and concomitant investment in production, processing, retail and consumption of livestock products that could offer economic opportunities for smallholders. When implemented right, the livestock revolution could increase wellbeing of rural poor across the continent (Delgado et al., 2001; Sumberg & Thompson 2013).

Yet, undeniably, livestock is a major threat to the environment (de Vries and de Boer, 2010; Steinfeld et al., 2006). Ruminants, in particular, are a major contributor of greenhouse gases (GHG) and, worldwide, generate 18 per cent of anthropogenic global greenhouse gases (Herrero et al., 2009). Additionally, livestock require a significant amount of land and water to produce feed, putting natural resources under pressure. Some feed-baskets require less land and water than others but livestock demand for land and water is already generating conflicts in drylands (Campbell et al., 2000; Pica-Ciamarra et al., 2007).

It is not possible to only get benefits from the livestock revolution; there are trade-offs and competing demands for natural resources (Herrero et al., 2009). The conflicts between crop farmers and livestock herders in areas where cropland is encroaching on grazing land is a good example. Therefore, there will be winners and losers. Yet, continuing with business as usual is likely to create only losers, resulting from a continued over-exploitation of natural resources which is possibly combined with little benefits to the poor (Thornton, 2010). There is therefore an urgency to explore pathways that will allow to maximise the benefits and minimise the losses, and to define what acceptable losses are.

Tanzania has long recognised the value of livestock in contributing to Tanzania's Agricultural Sector Development Programme (ASDP), National Strategy for Growth and Poverty Reduction (NSGRP), Rural Development Strategy (RDS), Comprehensive Africa Agriculture Development Programme (CAADP) and Tanzania Development Vision 2025. The National Livestock Policy (2006) has been implemented with the Tanzania Livestock Modernization Initiative (TLMI, 2015) for the period 2015/2016 - 2020/2021, with the goal to "increase food and nutrition security and food safety, create employment opportunities and contribute to the national economy, social stability and sustainable environment" and a purpose to "improve

the livelihoods of traditional and small holder livestock farmers and contribution of the sector to the national economy" (TLMI, 2015, p 9). The TLMI had 13 strategic areas including Tanzania Rangelands Conservation and Management, Resilient Tanzania Pastoral Communities and Conflict to Coexistence: Livestock and Conservation as well as focussing on improving genetics, health, feeding and markets. The recently launched Tanzania Livestock Master Plan (TLMP, Michael et al. 2018) continues the work of the TLMI, with the goal to 'help meet the ASDP II targets by improving productivity and total production in the key livestock value chains of poultry, pork, red meat and milk, and dairy' and doing so in such a way as to 'impact positively on rural livestock keepers in increasing their incomes and on urban consumers through lower animal product prices' and to achieve food and nutrition security at household and national levels (Michael et al. 2018, p xvi). Key environmental concerns within the Ministry of Livestock and Fisheries are feed resources and greenhouse gas impacts of livestock, particularly dairy. The TLMP forecasts a feed gap, i.e. less feed than will be demanded by the national livestock herd, of at least 20 per cent. In the environment department of the Vice President's Office, key concerns are the high number of animals and concerns for land degradation, and the increased pressure on land degradation where conflict between crop farmers and pastoralists leads to encroachment on protected lands. There is a Livestock and Fisheries Officer in the Vice President's Office, yet there is still little interaction between the ministries. Conflict is a cross-cutting issue, and the Government of Tanzania has set up a cross-ministerial Conflict Resolution Committee, headed by the Ministry of Livestock and Fisheries, and constituted by representatives from the Ministry of Livestock and Fisheries, the President's Office Regional Administration and Local Government, Ministry of Lands, Housing and Human Settlements Development, Ministry of Home Affairs, and Office of the Government Attorney General.

2. The intervention

The CLEANED R tool was developed to provide information on environmental impact. There is no inherent judgement of what impacts are good and what are bad – this judgement is made by those living in the area under change, and not the researchers.

The ResLeSS project under the SAIRLA programme has built on the CLEANED framework and CLEANED R tool to develop a facilitation process for the application of the tool. This process provides a learning space for bringing multiple stakeholders together to (i) contribute to building the CLEANED R tool so that it accurately represents their context and (ii) to then use the information provided by the tool to enable 'informed decisions' with regard to the four environmental proxies used in the framework (water used for feed production, soil nitrogen balance, greenhouse gases emitted during feed and animal production and biodiversity).

Two workshops were held with stakeholders in the small-scale dairy value chains: chairpersons of village-level livestock farmer groups, traders (feed supply, milk collection and processing, butcher, hotel manager) and administrators (Tanga Regional Secretariat, extension services, village chairman, milk cooperative union leader). The project carried out the same process in Burkina Faso and Ethiopia with stakeholders from the cattle, and cattle and sheep value chains respectively.

Following the completion of the second and final workshop in Lushoto in June 2018, two of the ResLeSS team members (Dr Geofrey Soka, SUA, the country project coordinator, and Dr Catherine Pfeifer, ILRI/FiBL, the CLEANED-R tool modeller), visited representatives of the Ministry of Livestock and Fisheries (MOLF) in Tanga and in Dodoma, introducing the ResLeSS process overall, and the findings from Lushoto. The meeting was facilitated by the Tanzania NLA and they were accompanied by Dr Eliezer Moses (Lushoto District Livestock and Fisheries Officer of Lushoto District), who has been working closely with the project to facilitate its implementation in Lushoto and to review the CLEANED-R tool data and assumptions. As the process had been completed in Burkina Faso by that stage, findings from Bama, Burkina Faso were mentioned. Comparing the two country sites shows that the learning process performs different roles according to the context. In Tanzania, it served to unite stakeholders around the value of increasing the uptake of small scale-dairy with cross-breeds, whereas in Burkina Faso, it served to establish a neutral space to start a conversation between two conflicting parties. Dr. Angello Joseph Mwilawa (Directorate Research. Train. and Ext., MOLF) was particularly interested to hear the experience from Burkina Faso and requested more information about the project in a policy brief, and in follow up meetings to explore the potential to use the learning process for conflict resolution in Tanzania.

In response to the interest from Dr Angello Joseph Mwilawa, Dr Soka worked closely with the Tanzania NLA over the rest of the project period to produce two versions of a policy brief and set up several follow up meetings (see below).

The ResLeSS team produced a policy brief of the findings and key messages from Burkina Faso and Tanzania, in collaboration with the Tanzania NLA/ANSAF (Mbarwa Kivuyo) and the ILRI Tanzania Value Chain Coordinator and leader of the Maziwa Zaidi programme (Dr. Amos Omore). This short brief was produced rapidly, to be ready for the anticipated launch of the Tanzania Livestock Master Plan (TLMP) in August 2018, to feed into the discussion on the future of livestock in Tanzania. When the actual launch of the TLMP was announced in March 2019, the Tanzania NLA and SAIRLA provided crucial support to revise a shorter version of the brief for the launch event.

In March 2019, Dr Soka together with the Tanzania National Learning Alliance presented the policy brief and the CLEANED R Tool at the launch of the Livestock Master Plan, and to the Deputy Minister for Livestock and Fisheries Hon. Abdallah Ulega (MP) who was impressed and directed the ResLeSS project team to share the tool with the Conflict Resolution Committee.

After several failed attempts to meet the committee to present the CLEANED R tool, the NLA together with Dr. Soka secured an appointment with the Ministry of Livestock and Fisheries in October 2019, with the department responsible for Grazing Lands and Animal Feed Resources. It is this Ministry that actually drafts the terms of reference for the Conflict Resolution Committee.

The meeting had two objectives:

1. To present the CLEANED R Tool to staff of the department of Grazing Lands and Animal Feed Resources in the Ministry of Livestock and Fisheries;
2. To plan a larger meeting that would include the Conflict Resolution Committee of the Ministry of Livestock and Fisheries

It was clear that the CLEANED R tool is capable of providing compelling evidence on the negative effects of overgrazing. Such evidence can be used by the training and extension department to sensitise livestock keepers and farmers on the best land use practices.

At the NLA meeting shortly afterwards, Dr Geofrey Soka presented to a panel discussion with the deputy chairperson of the Parliamentary Committee on Agriculture and Water, Hon Christine Ishengoma (MP) and a member of the same committee Hon. Jitu V. Soni (MP). Two MPs from Lushoto who attended the dialogue attested that the tool has potential in mitigating conflicts while improving economic gains and safeguarding the environment (tradeoffs).

Throughout the project, the NLA expressed interest in the CLEANED R tool and, following the June 2018 workshop, requested that the tool also be explained in Swahili to facilitate uptake at lower levels of local government structures.

Complementing the engagement activities by Dr Soka and the Tanzania NLA, Dr Catherine Pfeifer visited the MoLF and environment department of the Vice President's Office, supported by Dr Amos Omore. Although in the context of a separate project, these visits contributed to raising awareness about the CLEANED-R tool and having discussions about livestock and environment concerns in the ministries.

3. The change

The result of the follow up meetings and engagement with the Government of Tanzania by the Tanzania NLA and Dr Soka has been that the MoLF agreed to include the CLEANED-R tool and its engagement process in the toolbox of the cross-ministerial Conflict Resolution Committee. Several concrete steps were identified during the engagement meetings:

(i) In order for any outcomes of the CLEANED R tool and its engagement process to work effectively, by-laws should be strengthened and enforced. There should be laws (by-laws) at village levels to ensure that people see livestock keeping as a livelihood and an economic activity.

(ii) Village executive committees in conflict prone districts should be trained on the use of the tool and its engagement process. Once they are aware of the tool and are able to use it, they will make informed decisions favourable for both the livestock and the environment while minimizing conflicts. Since the tool plays a vital role in decision-making, it also fits well the leaders at ward level - including ward councillors. These are the people who can either cause or arrest conflicts in society. The project should see how it can take the tool down to the councillors' level.

(iii) Ensure that land use plans are produced in all conflict hotspot areas. These plans must be adhered to by all stakeholders. Livestock should be considered as an economic and livelihood undertaking.

(iv) Use the tool as a model in training livestock keepers on the benefits of destocking. The maps generated by the tool can provide scenarios showing suitable number of animals per unit area or the amount of biomass needed in a particular area for maintaining a certain number of livestock. Evidence from the maps are powerful visual training tools for livestock keepers.

It was proposed that the tool should be further tested in areas like Katavi region, which is designated for livestock keeping. The experts from the Ministry observed that if the tool was piloted in conflict-stricken areas, it would give more convincing findings that those obtained from Lushoto District. From the panel discussion at the NLA meeting, the MPs wanted to see the application of the tool being scaled up to cover more regions.

4. Success factors

- In sharing the outcomes from the ResLeSS project process in Burkina Faso with Tanzanian decision makers, the ResLeSS team and Tanzania NLA inadvertently hit on a subject of much concern in Tanzania: conflict, including between farmers and livestock herders. Therefore, it was useful to visit the ministries at a stage in the project when the research project had lessons to share, not just from Tanzania, but also from other countries.
- At both local and national levels, it was valuable to build on the connections and previous work of Dr Amos Omore, Country Coordinator of ILRI in Tanzania, and of the country programme promoting small scale dairy production, Maziwa Zaidi (Omore, 2017). The Maziwa Zaidi programme has been running since 2012, with several projects under its umbrella. Therefore, the Maziwa Zaidi name is well-known among stakeholders and trust has been built. At the national level, the relationships that Dr Omore already has with policy makers in Dar es Salaam and Dodoma were valuable in securing initial meetings, complementing the support of the NLA. It was also valuable to place the ResLeSS project in the context of the Maziwa Zaidi when introducing the project, so that it was not 'just another project doing its own thing' but contributing to a larger body of work.
- The timing of engagements was fortuitous and the project team and NLA worked in an agile and flexible manner to respond to the opportunities created. The key meetings following the second workshop came at a time when the ministry was finalising the Tanzania Livestock Master Plan, so the topic of the future of livestock was current. As such the ResLeSS team made an effort to produce a brief that would feed directly into that conversation. When the actual launch of the TLMP was announced in March 2019, the Tanzania NLA and SAIRLA provided crucial support to produce a targeted shorter version of the brief for the launch event.
- A final success factor was being able make a concrete link from local to national scale through personal testimonies of the (perceived) value of the ResLeSS process. Inviting the District Head of Agriculture (Dr Eliezer Moses) to travel with the ResLeSS team to various engagement meetings with regional and national level representatives of the ministry, and to NLA meetings, made a personal local-to-national link. This was effective for testifying about the value of the multi-stakeholder learning process, both from having been part of facilitating the process, and from seeing the changes in local behaviour since the second and final workshop. Making a national-to-national link came in the form of local MPs contributing to the panel discussion at the NLA meeting.

5. Looking forward

- The ministry officials agreed to include the CLEANED R tool in the package of tools for conflict and dispute mediation. The department is a technical team that drafts the terms of reference for the conflict resolution committee. With this in mind, meeting the department has pre-empted the meeting with the conflict resolution committee. The experts will integrate the application of the tool in the terms of reference.
- They agreed to practice the tool and share it with the Director of Research and Extension because this department is running training across the country for livestock keepers and other actors in the value chain. If this tool is adopted by the training and extension department, it will be rolled out throughout the country.
- The department will invite the team to make another presentation to a larger group involving other departments within the ministry of livestock and fisheries.
- ANSAF is keen to continue collaborating with SUA and the MoLF to implement the steps discussed in the engagement meetings, subject to funding opportunities arising to enable ongoing work.

6. Sources of evidence

Field reports from Geofrey Soka of the meetings:

Soka, G. 2019. Sharing the CLEANED R tool for wider uptake with policy and decision makers. (Field report of meeting, 12 March 2019)

Soka, G. 2019. Availing the CLEANED-R Tool to staff of the Ministry of Livestock and Fisheries, Department of Grazing Land and Animal Feed Resources (Field report of meeting, 28 October 2019)

Feedback from the NLA on the draft story of change (see email from Geofrey, 7 November 2019)

Personal communication – Feedback to Dr Soka from Dr Eliezer Moses.

7. Acknowledgements

Authors: Joanne Morris and Geofrey Soka

Editor: Deborah Mansfield

8. Literature cited

Azzarri, C., Zezza, A., Haile, B., Cross, E. (2015) 'Does Livestock Ownership Affect Animal Source Foods Consumption and Child Nutritional Status? Evidence from Rural Uganda' *Journal of Development Studies* 51: 1034–1059 https://doi.org/10.1080/00220388.2015.1018905

Campbell, D.J., Gichohi, H., Mwangi, A., Chege, L. (2000) 'Land use conflict in Kajiado District, Kenya', *Land Use Policy* 17: 337–348 https://doi.org/10.1016/S0264-8377(00)00038-7

de Vries, M., de Boer, I.J.M. (2010) 'Comparing environmental impacts for livestock products: A review of life cycle assessments', *Livestock Science* 128: 1–11 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.livsci.2009.11.007

Delgado, C., Rosegrant, M., Steinfeld, H., Ehui, S., Courbois, C. (2001) 'Livestock to 2020: The Next Food Revolution', *Outlook on Agriculture* 30: 27–29 https://doi.org/10.5367/000000001101293427

Enahoro, D., Lannerstad, M., Pfeifer, C., Dominguez-Salas, P. (2018) 'Contributions of livestock derived foods to nutrient supply under changing demand in low- and middle-income countries', *Global Food Security* 19: 1–10 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.gfs.2018.08.002

Herrero, M., Thornton, P.K., Gerber, P., Reid, R.S. (2009) 'Livestock, livelihoods and the environment: understanding the trade-offs', *Current Opinion In Environmental Sustainability* 1: 111–120 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cosust.2009.10.003

Moll, H.A.J. (2005) 'Costs and benefits of livestock systems and the role of market and nonmarket relationships', *Agricultural Economics* 32: 181–193. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.0169-5150.2005.00210.x

Omore, A. (2017) 'Maziwa Zaidi past, present and future: reflecting on an inclusive dairy development initiative in Tanzania', *CGIAR Research Program on Livestock blog*, 26 June 2017 https://livestock.cgiar.org/2017/06/26/maziwa-zaidi-past-present-future (Accessed: 3 March 2020)

Pica-Ciamarra, U., Otte, J., Chilonda, P. (2007) *Livestock Policies, Land and Rural Conflicts in Sub-Saharan Africa,* Research Report No. RR Nr. 07-04, Pro-Poor Livestock Policy Initiative, Rome: Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations

Randolph, T.F., Schelling, E., Grace, D., Nicholson, C.F., Leroy, J.L., Cole, D.C., Demment, M.W., Omore, A., Zinsstag, J., Ruel, M. (2007) 'Invited Review: Role of livestock in human nutrition and health for poverty reduction in developing countries', Journal of Animal Sciences, 85: 2788–2800. https://doi.org/10.2527/jas.2007-0467

Sumberg, J. and Thompson, J. (2013) 'Revolution Reconsidered: Evolving perspectives on livestock production and consumption', *STEPS Working Paper 52*, Brighton: Institute of Development Studies. https://steps-centre.org/publication/revolution-reconsidered-evolving-perspectives-on-livestock-production-and-consumption/ (Accessed 3 March 2020)

Steinfeld, H., Gerber, P., Wassenaar, T., Castel, V., Rosales, M., de Haan, C. (2006) *Livestock's Long Shadow: Environmental Issues and Options*, Rome: Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations

'Tanzania Livestock Modernization Initiative' *(2015)* Tanzania: United Republic of Tanzania and Ministry of Livestock and Fisheries Development https://livestocklivelihoodsandhealth.org/wp-content/uploads/2015/07/Tanzania_Livestock_Modernization_Initiative_July_2015.pdf (Accessed 3 March 2020)

Michael, S., Mbwambo, N., Mruttu, H., Dotto, M., Ndomba, C., da Silva, M., Makusaro, F., Nandonde, S., Crispin, J., Shapiro, B., Desta, S., Nigussie, K., Negassa, A. and Gebru, G. (2018) 'Tanzania livestock master plan', Nairobi: International Livestock Research Institute (ILRI) https://hdl.handle.net/10568/92405, (Accessed 3 March 2020)